

BEFORE THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
GARDEN CITY, ADA COUNTY, IDAHO

In the Matter of:)	DSRFY2020-6
)	
Design Review)	FINDINGS OF FACT,
5320 N. Sawyer Ave.)	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW
Garden City, Ada County, Idaho)	AND DECISION
<hr/>		

THIS MATTER, came before the Garden City Design Review Committee for consideration on June 1, 2020. The Design Review Committee reviewed the application and materials submitted. Based on the evidence presented, pursuant to Garden City Code Table 8-6A-1, the Design Review Committee makes the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The applicant is Victor Ferral with BRS Architects.
2. The property owner is Michael J. Braught.
3. The location of the project is 5320 N. Sawyer Ave.; Ada County Parcel # R1055420071
4. The application is for a design review for new construction of two structures and associated site improvements.
5. The project is located in the Garden City LI Light Industrial Zoning District.
6. The project is located in the Light Industrial Bradley Technology District of the Garden City Comprehensive Plan Land Use Designation.
7. The project is not located in the floodplain according to the 2003 FIRM.
8. The project is not located in the floodplain according to the 2017 FIS.
9. The following standards apply to this proposal:
 - a. Garden City Code 8-6B-3: Design Review Committee
 - b. Garden City Code 8-6A: Administration – General Provisions
10. The following plans and policies apply to this proposal:
 - a. Garden City Comprehensive Plan
 - b. Garden City Sidewalk Policy

c. Garden City Street Light Policy

11. The applicant provided the following application information:

Materials Provided Per GCC Table 8-6A-2 Required Application Information			
Provided			
Yes	No	Waived pursuant to GCC 8-6A-4	
X			Compliance Statement
X			Neighborhood Map
X			Site Plan
X			Landscape Plan
X			Schematic Drawings
		X	Lighting Plan
		X	Topographic Survey
		X	Grading Plan
X			Will Serve
X			Verification that address is an Ada County Approved Address

14. The following noticing was completed in accordance with GCC 8-6A and GCC 8-6B-3:

Noticing Requirement	Required Date	Completion Date
Letter of Acceptance	5/16/2020	5/13/2020
Notice of Intent to Approve or to Deny	5/16/2020	5/14/2020
Interested Parties	N/A No interested parties	
Legal Notice	5/16/2020	5/14/2020
Agency Notice	5/16/2020	5/12/2020
Property Posting Sign	5/22/2020	5/21/2020
Affidavit of Property Posting and Photos	5/25/2020	5/21/2020
Agenda Posting	5/31/2020	5/13/2020
Website Posting	5/31/2020	5/12/2020

12. On 2/18/2020, in accordance with GCC 8-6B-3, a pre-application conference was held with the Design Committee. The Committee provided the following comments and requests:

- a. Verification that trees cannot be planted in the utility easement along N. Sawyer Ave. is required. Otherwise, street trees must be planted.
- b. If possible, move building closer to street and have patios and landscaping in front setback.

- c. Take future fairgrounds redevelopment into account when designing façade along N. Alworth Street.
 - d. Consider closing middle access for better interior flow, allow more landscaping, and screening of operations from street.
 - e. Consider going taller with buildings to better relate to street.
 - f. Consider need for additional trash enclosure.
 - g. Consider splitting up rooflines longer than 50'. Consider providing more roofline articulation.
 - h. Vary the materials to not look like a metal building.
 - i. Break up massing so buildings are not one large structure.
 - j. Lose prefabricated appearance of buildings as notice in GCC 8-4C-5C.
 - k. Provide pedestrian interconnectivity between buildings such as striping or other pedestrian path.
13. On 4/6/2020, in accordance with GCC 8-6B-3, a pre-application conference was held with the Design Committee. The Committee provided the following comments and requests:
- a. Provide landscaping that meets Garden City Code 8-4I.
 - b. Incorporate more fenestration and modulation into the elevations.
 - c. Consider reevaluating the middle access point or consider screening such as landscaping the loading bay doors at the middle access.
 - d. Consider changes to the roofline pitches for more roofline variation.
 - e. Provide additional material changes and identify them in the materials.
 - f. Consider raising the height of the structures for more street presence.
 - g. Change the look of the structures to have a less prefabricated design pursuant to 8-4C-5.
 - h. Add architectural elements to reduce prefabricated look and to increase change in depth and scale the buildings down to a pedestrian friendly look along the street.
 - i. Provide documentation that utility easement along N. Sawyer prohibits trees within required landscape areas.
14. On 6/1/2020, a public hearing before the Design Committee was held:
- i. Victor Ferral presented the application.
 - ii. Chris Samples presented the staff report.
 - iii. No one wished to testify on the matter.
 - iv. Public testimony was closed.
 - v. Committee member Hurd moved to approve the application with the following changes to the draft conditions:
 - 1. Provide renderings shown to Committee during meeting.
 - 2. A list of the updates provided in the rendering and adequate information to verify code compliance, including but not limited to:
 - a. Building elements including pergolas
 - b. Material changes on buildings
 - c. Concrete internal connecting sidewalks

- d. Stamped concrete and pedestrian lighting at access
- e. Planting types and numbers
- 3. Windows provided in garage doors as in previous renderings.
- 4. Pergola/ trellis better integrated into architecture- suggestion includes removing posts closest to structure and eaves matching the pitch of roof.
- 5. East façade of warehouse 2 needs to be broken into 50' maximum wall planes.
- 6. Better screening of loading areas via a more solid screen that is 5'-6' tall or uninterrupted plantings between the tree planters that will be 5'-6' tall and incorporate evergreen components.
- 7. Retail needs to meet retail glazing requirements of code
- vi. Committee member Gresham seconded the motion.
- vii. The motion carried unanimously.

15. The record contains:
- a. Pre-Application Meeting Conference Materials
 - b. Application
 - c. Compliance Statement
 - d. Letter of Intent
 - e. Plan Sheets
 - f. Will Serve Letter
 - g. Noticing Documents:
 - h. Agency Comments:
 - i. Garden City Public Works
 - ii. Garden City Engineer
 - i. 2/18/2020 Design Committee Hearing Minutes
 - j. 4/6/2020 Design Committee Hearing Minutes
 - k. 6/1/2020 Design Committee Hearing Minutes
 - l. Signed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision

15. In order to approve a design review application, the Design Committee shall make the following findings:

GCC 8-6B-3 DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE: REQUIRED FINDINGS			
Conclusion			
Compliant	Not Compliant	Not Applicable to this Application	Standard
X			Standard: The proposed design is in conformance with the purpose of the zoning district and all dimensional regulations of that district.

			<p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>
X			<p>The proposed design adheres to standards for the protection of health, safety, and general welfare.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>
X			<p>The proposed design creates a sense of place and contributes to the uniqueness of the different districts and neighborhoods within the city.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>
X			<p>The proposed design improves the accessibility of development to non-motorized and public modes of transportation.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>
X			<p>The proposed design supports a development pattern in nodes rather than strip commercial along arterial corridors.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the</p>

			reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.
X			<p>The proposed design supports a compact development pattern that enables intensification of development and changes over time.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>
X			<p>The proposed design provides outdoor spaces and landscaping compatible with the southwest Idaho climatic conditions and encourages pedestrian activity.</p> <p>Explanation:</p> <p>The application meets this finding. The application is in conformance with the reviewed sections of code noted in this decision.</p>

16. The record was reviewed by the Design Committee to render the decision.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Design Review Committee reviewed the application with regard to Garden City Code, Title 8, Chapter 4, and based on the conditions required herein, concludes the application **meets** the standards of approval under **GCC 8-6B-3 Design Review Committee**.

DECISION

WHEREFORE, based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law contained herein, the Design Review Committee hereby **APPROVES** the application, subject to the following conditions:

Site Specific Requirements:

Prior to Building Permit Issuance:

1. A parking study shall be provided to the Planning Official for review in accordance with Garden City Code 8-4D-5.
2. Provide renderings shown to Committee during meeting.
3. A list of the updates provided in the rendering and adequate information to verify code compliance, including but not limited to:
 - a. Building elements including pergolas
 - b. Material changes on buildings
 - c. Concrete internal connecting sidewalks
 - d. Stamped concrete and pedestrian lighting at access
 - e. Planting types and numbers
2. Windows must be provided in garage doors as in previous renderings.
3. Pergola/ trellis better integrated into architecture- suggestion includes removing posts closest to structure and eaves matching the pitch of roof.
4. East façade of warehouse 2 needs to be broken into 50' maximum wall planes.
5. Better screening of loading areas via a more solid screen that is 5'-6' tall **or** uninterrupted plantings between the tree planters that will be 5'-6' tall and also incorporate evergreen components.
6. Retail needs to meet retail glazing requirements of code

Site Specific Requirements for the Duration of the Use:

1. Prior to the issuance of sign permits, a master sign plan shall be reviewed by the Design Committee in accordance with Garden City Code 8-4F.

General Requirements:

1. This review and approval is specific to the design of the project. Final approval is subject to the approval of other reviewing agencies. Any more restrictive standards adopted and made applicable by any Transportation Authority, Fire Authority or other Federal, State or Local regulatory agencies shall prevail. This approval shall not annul any portion of Garden City Code or other applicable regulation unless specifically noted.
2. Any changes to the plans and specifications upon which this approval is based, other than those required by the above conditions, will require submittal of an application for modification and approval of that application prior to commencing any change.
3. All improvements and operations shall comply with applicable local, state and federal requirements and procedures whether specifically addressed in the analysis of this application or not. This shall include but not be limited to 8-4A General Provisions of

Design and Development Regulations; 8-4I-3 and Landscape Maintenance Provisions 8-4I-9; and Standards for Transportation and Connectivity Provisions identified in 8-4E.

4. All utilities on the site, including telephone, cable television, and electrical systems shall be underground and in compliance with Garden City Code 8-4A-8.
5. Driveway openings in curbs shall comply with the requirements of the Transportation Authority. The driveway shall be straight or provide a 28-foot inside and 48-foot outside turning radius.
6. Plant materials which exhibit evidence of insect pests, disease, and/or damage shall be appropriately treated to correct the problem. Dead plant materials shall be replaced.
7. Where landscaping might impact motorist or pedestrian sight distance, shrubs shall be maintained below three feet (3') in height and trees shall be pruned so that the lowest branches will be at least seven feet (7') above the ground level.
8. A three-foot (3') clearance zone shall be maintained around the circumference of fire hydrants.
9. Retain and protect existing trees, vegetation, and native soils and integrate these features into the overall landscape plan as required by or exempted from Garden City Code 8-4I and as shown in the approved landscape plans.
10. Required landscape areas shall be at least seventy percent (70%) covered with vegetation at maturity, with mulch used under and around the plants. Use of mulch, organic or rock as the only ground cover in required planting areas is prohibited.
11. If trees are staked, the stakes shall be removed within twelve (12) months to prevent damage to the tree.
12. All planting areas that border driveways, parking lots, and other vehicle use areas shall be protected by curbing, wheel stops, or other approved protective devices.
13. Trees shall be planted at least three feet (3') from curbs, sidewalks, driveways and other hard surfaces to buffer from stress caused by vehicle overhang and compacted soils or planted with sufficient space to provide for the full maturity of the particular tree species.
14. All other plant material, except sod or ground cover, shall be set back a minimum of one foot (1') from any curb edge to protect from vehicle overhang and mechanical damage.
15. The landscape installation shall stabilize all soil and slopes.
16. All required landscaping shall be provided with an automatically controlled irrigation system in conformance with the best management practices for automatic irrigation systems.
17. Demonstrate compliance with or an exemption from Garden City Code 8-4G prior to certificate of occupancies.
18. This approval is for this application only. Additional permits, licenses and approvals may be necessary. All other applicable permits must be obtained prior to a Certificate of Occupancy.
19. Property Maintenance Standards shall be maintained as required by Garden City Code.
20. The property owner is responsible for the maintenance of all landscaping and screening devices required.
21. System Installation Required: Each and every lot within the subdivision shall have underground pressurized irrigation water. The pressurized irrigation system shall be constructed and installed at the same time as the domestic water lines but shall not necessarily be in the same trenches.
22. Materials submitted after the decision shall not be considered part of the record for this decision. If additional materials or information is submitted after the decision the application may be remanded to the decision-making body during which time the decision shall be stayed provided that there is no immediate threat to life or safety.

23. Any changes in the design, construction, operation or use shall be brought to the immediate attention of the Planning Official for determination if the changes are in substantial conformance with the City's action. Any modification to approved plans shall require submittal and approval of these modifications prior to construction. Final approval is based on substantial conformance with the plans reviewed and approved.
24. Any substantial changes to the design shall be reviewed by the Design Review Committee for compliance with Garden City Code 8-4. Any other changes that are not in substantial conformance with the approval shall be remanded to the decision-making body.
25. Occupying the site prior to Certificate of Occupancy is a criminal offense.
26. There is a 15 day right to appeal to City Council. The applicant or any interested parties may appeal the decision or a part of the decision. An appeal shall be made on the form provided by the City and filed with the City Clerk within 15 days after the action of the decision.
27. If any term or provision of this decision, to any extent, is held invalid or unenforceable, the remaining terms and provisions hereof shall not be affected thereby, but each such remaining term and provision shall be valid and enforced to the fullest extent permitted by law.

6/1/2020

Timothy Thornbarron

This signature verifies that this decision document has been reviewed and approved by the Design Review Committee

Date