



CITY OF GARDEN CITY

6015 Glenwood Street □ Garden City, Idaho 83714
Phone (208)472-2921 □ Fax (208)472-2926

File Number: DSRFY2019-23
For: Multi-Family Development
Location: 6265 N. Strawberry Glenn Rd., Garden City, Idaho
Applicant: Dave Eadie, Kennedy Wilson/The Architect's Office
Report Date: 9/11/2019



Garden City Design Committee
Staff Contact: Chris Samples

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

**City of Garden City
Staff Report**

A. Project Overview

Project Description:

Dave Eadie with Kennedy Wilson/The Architects Office PLLC is requesting a pre-application conference for a design review of a multi-family dwelling unit development. The proposal is located at 6265 N Strawberry Glenn Rd., Garden City, 83714; Ada County Parcel # R8191505455. The property is within R-3 zoning district and the Residential Medium Density Comprehensive Plan Land Use Designation.

Proposed Scope of Work:

Request	Review Process	Notes
Design Review Pre-Application Conference	8-6B-3 Design Review	Pre-Application Conference Only. Not a formal application.

Project Details:

Proposed Development: Multi-Family Development

Number of Buildings: 12 structures

- Six dwelling unit structures
- Five parking garage structures
- One community office structure

Number of Dwelling Units: 90

- 36 One bedroom/one bath
- 48 Two bedroom/two bath
- 6 Three bedroom/ two bath

Parking Spaces: 191

- 108 garage spaces (freestanding and below structure)
- 36 uncovered dwelling unit parking spaces
- 46 guest parking spaces
- 1 maintenance garage space (nonresident/non-guest space)

Bicycle Parking: 152 spaces

Site Coverage:

- Buildings: 58,113 sq. ft.
- Landscaping: 72,867 sq. ft.
- Impervious surface: 86,524 sq. ft.

Trash Enclosure: Two

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

Site Conditions

1. Address: 6265 N. Strawberry Glenn Rd.
2. Parcel Number: R8191505455
3. Property Size: 5 acres
4. Zoning District: R-3 Medium Density Residential
5. Comprehensive Plan Land Use Map Designation: Residential Low Density
6. Floodplain Designation:
 - 2003 FIRM: AE
 - 2017 Draft FIRM: AE
7. Surrounding Uses:
 - Dwelling Unit, Multi-Family
 - Dwelling Unit, Single Family Detached
 - Dwelling Unit, Single Family Attached
 - Nursing and Residential Care Facility
8. Existing Use: No use on site
9. Easements:
 - Prescriptive Greenbelt Easement – Northeast property corner
 - Undocumented Irrigation Easement – South portion of property
10. Site Access: N. Strawberry Glenn Rd. access proposed
11. Sidewalks: No sidewalk installed

Required Decisions

The following decision processes are required for the project:

Decision	Recommendation Authority	Decision Authority	Hearing Date
Design Review	N/A	Design Committee	To be scheduled.

Pursuant to 8-6B-3 (Design Review Committee), a pre-application conference is required with the Committee prior to a formal design review application. A formal application is required for a design review decision. Formal design review applications are required to be noticed in accordance with 8-6A-7 (Public Hearing Process).

Exhibits: [Link](#)

1. Pre-Application Form
2. Pre-Application Staff Report
3. Project Submittal Letter
4. Compliance Matrix – Comprehensive Plan
5. Compliance Matrix – Base Zoning Provisions
6. Neighborhood meeting Letter
7. Sheet C100 Site Plan
8. Sheet L000 Tree Mitigation Plan
9. Sheet L100 Landscape Plan
10. Sheet L150 Landscape Details
11. Conceptual Design Package (Sheets T1.0 - A4.13)
12. DSRFY2019 – 1 – Site Plan (for application submittal compliance purposes only)

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

Standards for Review: Standards for review of this application are:

Design Review Standards	
Standard	Staff Comments
8-2B-1 Purpose	Density standards reviewed
8-2B-2 Allowed Uses	Permitted use noted
8-2B-3 Form Standards	Setbacks noted
8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multi-Family	Compliance issues identified
8-3B Flood Hazard	Noted for informational purposes only
8-4A General Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-4B Residential Design Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-4C-4B Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site	Compliance issues identified
8-4D Parking and Loading Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-4E Transportation and Connectivity Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-4I Landscaping and Tree Protection Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-4L Open Space Provisions	Compliance issues identified
8-6B-3 Design Review	Compliance issues identified

Policies and Studies: The following policies and studies were reviewed for this application:

1. [Garden City Sidewalk Policy](#)
2. [Garden City Street Light Policy](#)
3. [Greenbelt Easements](#)

Additional Information:

DSRFY2019-1 was a previous design review application for multi-family development on the property. The application consisted of a design review, a waterway tiling request, and a master site plan (required of the previously enacted Boise River and Greenbelt Overlay District). On February 25, 2019, the City Council denied the master site plan, which by default automatically denied the design review and waterway tiling request.

The Boise River and Greenbelt Overlay District was repealed prior to this application. A master site plan is not required for this application.

Pursuant to 8-6A-3E (General Application Process), an application that has been denied shall be resubmitted in substantially the same form for the same use within one (1) year from the date of denial. This subsection also authorizes the planning official to waive the one (1) year requirement and accept a new application if the subject property is affected by amendments to the comprehensive plan or to Title 8. The applicant has not requested a planning official waiver pursuant to 8-6A-3E.

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

The new application was accepted due to the new application not being in substantially the same form for the same use. The following differences are noted between the previous and proposed site plans:

1. Dwelling units reduced from 108 to 90
2. Reduction of four (4) story structure height to three (3) stories
3. Reconfiguration of building footprint locations
4. Reconfiguration of parking area locations

The previous site plan is provided in the record for this application only to document compliance with 8-6A-3E.

B. Design Review

DESIGN STANDARDS FOR REVIEW	
City Code	City Standards/Staff Comments
<u>8-2B Base Zoning District Provisions</u>	
8-2B-1 Purpose	<p>1. <u>Density:</u></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Proposed density: 19 units per acre</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Maximum allowed density: 35 units per acre</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">The minimum 14 unit per acre density is not required for this property. The property is not located within a transit oriented development node or a neighborhood commercial node, as depicted on the Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use map.</p> <p>2. Typical Housing Types</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Multi-family dwelling units are the proposed housing type for this application. This use is listed in this subsection as a typical housing type for the R-3 zone.</p>
8-2B-2 Allowed Uses	<p>The use "Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family" is a permitted use in the R-3 zone. The use's definition pursuant to 8-7A (Definitions) is noted below:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family: <i>A structure or property containing three (3) or more principal dwelling units. The term "multi-family dwelling unit" includes</i></p>

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

	<p><i>apartments and condominiums with varying arrangements of entrances and party walls.</i></p>
<p>GCC 8-2B-3 Form Standards</p>	<p>1. <u>The form standards for the R-3 zone are:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maximum Height: None • Front Setback: 5'/20' * • Rear Setback: 15' • Interior Side: 0'/5'** • Street Side: 5' • Maximum Lot Coverage: 70% • Minimum Lot Area/Dwelling Unit: N/A <p>* Front setback exception: Subsection F.8 of this ordinance requires a 20' setback for a garage when access to that garage is directly taken from a public street. The remainder of the structure is subject to the 5' setback.</p> <p>** Interior side setback exception: The ordinance is silent on when a 0' and a 5' setback should apply. 8-3C-3A-6 (Live-Work-Crete Overlay District) contains the same setback but allows an applicant to select which interior side receives each setback. To ensure this title is implemented consistently, the interior side setback should be interpreted similar to 8-3C-3A-6.</p> <p>2. <u>Additional form standard requirements:</u></p> <p>Subsection F.8 requires each building of a multi-family dwelling to be considered separately for the purpose of determining setbacks. Each building is required to have one (1) front, one (1) rear, and two (2) side yard setbacks.</p> <p>3. <u>Determination of setback locations and lot coverage percentage</u></p> <p>In concert with 8-7A (Definitions) and as applied consistently with other development applications, setbacks shall be measured from the following property lines:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Front: Property line along N. Strawberry Glenn Rd. • Rear: Property line opposite of N. Strawberry

	<p>Glenn Rd.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interior Sides: Property line along Greenbelt and property line opposite of Greenbelt. <p>Lot coverage is evaluated in aggregate as required by 8-7A (Definitions) rather than each building individually.</p> <p>4. <u>Proposed form standards:</u></p> <p>The form standards proposed for each structure are:</p> <p>Building 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Height: 3-story, 34' 3" to roof midpoint Front Setback: Exceeds 5' Rear Setback: Exceed 15' Interior Side: Exceed 0'/5' <p>Buildings 2-4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Height: 3-story, 34' 3" to roof midpoint Front Setback: 5' Rear Setback: Exceeds 15' Interior Side: Exceeds 0'/5' <p>Buildings 5 and 6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Height: 3-story, 34' 3" to roof midpoint Front Setback: Exceeds 5' Rear Setback: Exceeds 15' Interior Side: Exceeds 0'/5' <p>Community Building:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Height: 1-story, 17' 3" (no height reference noted) Front Setback: Exceeds 5' Rear Setback: Exceeds 15' Interior Side: Exceeds 0'/5' <p>Garages G-01 – G-03:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Height: 1-story, 12' (no height reference noted) Front Setback: Exceeds 5' Rear Setback: 15'
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interior Side: Exceeds 0’/5’ <p>Garages G-04 and G-05:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Height: 1-story, 12’ (no height reference noted) • Front Setback: Exceeds 5’ • Rear Setback: Exceeds 15’ • Interior Side: Exceeds 0’/5’ <p>Lot Coverage:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property square footage: 217,800 sq. ft. • 70% lot coverage: 152,460 sq. ft. • Proposed lot coverage: 58,113 sq. ft. • Proposed lot coverage percentage: 26.6% <p>Additional setbacks are required by 8-2C-15 and will be reviewed below.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-2C Land Use Provisions</u></p>	
<p>GCC 8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multi-Family</p>	<p>1. <u>Required Setback</u></p> <p>Required setback between buildings: 10’.</p> <p>The setback between Garage G-4 and G-04 is 9’ and below the minimum standard of this section. The other structures appear to meet this standard.</p> <p>2. <u>Required Amenities</u></p> <p>Required amenities for multi-family development – 75 units or more: Four (At least one from each category)</p> <p>Amenity categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Life (clubhouse, fitness facilities, enclosed bike storage, public art) • Open Space (open grassy area 50’x100’ minimum size, community garden, ponds or water features, plaza) • Recreation (pool, walking trails, children’s play structures, sports courts) <p>3. <u>Proposed amenities</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of life: 1) Existing clubhouse from adjacent associated multi-family development;

- 2) Existing fitness facility from adjacent associated multi-family development; 3) New enclosed bike storage
- Open Space: 1) 22,675 sq. ft. open grass area; 2) Outdoor plaza
- Recreation: Existing pool from adjacent associated multi-family development; Walking trails connecting Greenbelt to new development

Title 8 does not define the term “walking trails”. 8-1A-5 (Interpretation) requires the Merriam-Webster dictionary be utilized for undefined terms:

- Walking: The action of one who walks
- Trail: A marked or established path or route especially through a forest or mountainous region

When evaluated against these definitions, the proposed pedestrian pathways connecting to the Greenbelt do not appear to constitute a walking trail. While the Greenbelt appears to fit the definition noted above, the intent of the amenity in the context of the definition is to have a separate pedestrian pathway that looks and functions like the Greenbelt. The landscape plan (Sheet L100) appears to show a walking trail from the Greenbelt to the end of Building 1 near the Wetland Mitigation Area. The extent of this walking trail could constitute an amenity.

The code is silent on whether amenities from adjacent developments can be counted toward the amenity requirements. The adjacent multi-family development is owned by the property owner for this proposal. Easements providing cross access and guaranteeing access to the amenities would ensure access to them and meet the intent of this ordinance.

4. Site Maintenance

A recorded site maintenance agreement is required by this ordinance. This requirement is usually reviewed administratively during the building permit process.

	<p>5. <u>Additional Standards for 20+ unit Developments</u></p> <p>The following additional improvements are required by this ordinance:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A property management office • A maintenance storage area • A central mailbox location, including provisions for parcel mail that provide safe pedestrian and/or vehicular access • A directory and map of the development at an entrance or convenience location for those entering the development <p>According to the applicant's Compliance Statement, Base Zoning Provisions, dated August 16, 2019, the property management office is proposed within the existing adjacent multi-family development. Additionally, the Compliance Statement indicates the proposed development will include the central mailbox area and maintenance storage areas. These additional requirements are not depicted in the site plan Sheet C100. The directory/map requirement is not addressed in the application materials.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-3B Flood Hazard</u></p>	<p>The property is located in the 100-year flood plain (Zone AE). The standards of this article are usually reviewed administratively through a flood plain permit. However, the application is not clear on if any fill will be brought into the site and how this will affect building heights. The applicant should address this with the Committee.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-4A General Provisions</u></p>	<p style="background-color: black; color: black;">[REDACTED]</p>
<p>GCC 8-4A-3 Fences and Walls</p>	<p>According to site plan Sheet C100, a four foot (4') wrought iron fence is proposed along/near the north (Greenbelt) property line and a six foot (6') masonry wall are proposed along the south and west property lines. The masonry wall is proposed adjacent to existing fencing. While not expressly prohibited by code, such a configuration may raise property maintenance issues in the future. Consideration of both the applicant and adjacent property owners should be given to this potential issue.</p>

GCC 8-4A-4 Outdoor Lighting	A photometric plan and light fixture cut sheets were not provided for evaluation.
GCC 8-4A-5 Outdoor Service and Equipment Areas	<p>The site plan (C100) does not specifically note the location of HVAC ground units but does appear to depict areas adjacent to the structure that serve this purpose. The possible HVAC ground units screening consists of a 4' wrought iron fence and landscaping. The units adjacent to buildings 2-4 are located adjacent to N. Strawberry Glenn Rd.</p> <p>HVAC equipment is required by this section to either 1) be 50' from the property lines or 2) be fully enclosed and baffled so no noise is detected on any adjoining property and incorporated into the overall design of buildings and landscaping so that visual and acoustic impacts are fully contained and out of view from adjacent properties and public streets. The application documents are not clear whether the screening meets these standards.</p> <p>Trash enclosures are also subject to the standards of this section. Trash enclosure elevations were not included in the application materials.</p>
GCC 8-4A-7 Stormwater Systems	Stormwater drainage systems are usually evaluated administratively during the building permit and/or public works permit process.
GCC 8-4A-8 Utilities	Utilities are required to be installed underground. Utilities are usually evaluated administratively during the public works permit process.
GCC 8-4A-9 Waterways	Subsection B.2 of this ordinance requires irrigation ditches to remain open unless waived by the Design Committee. However, guidance from the City Attorney indicates that Idaho Code enables property owners to enclose and tile irrigation ditches if permission from the irrigation district is obtained and district standards are met. This subsection appears to not be enforceable.
<u>GCC 8-4B Design Provisions for Residential Structures</u>	

<p>GCC 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Residential Dwelling Units – Building Setbacks</p>	<p>The standards of this ordinance are intended to address how the placement of windows, entrances, porches, and patios impact adjacent properties. Privacy, visual and acoustical impacts are intended to be addressed by these standards. The applicant has proposed a combination of building design, building location, fencing and landscaping to address these impacts. This section of the report will only address building design, as required by the ordinance. The landscaping and fencing components will be addressed below under 8-4I-5 (Perimeter Landscaping).</p> <p>Sheets A1.2 – A1.4 depict the view shed of Buildings Four, Five, and Six to three existing single family detached homes. The views of Buildings One – Three not addressed as well as the views of existing single family homes located across from the wetland mitigation area, the southwest property lines without garage buildings, and adjacent to a gap between Garage G-04 and G-05. The application materials do not address whether the view sheds include any fill required to meet the requirements of 8-3B (Flood Hazard). Each proposed building containing dwelling units will be addressed individually.</p> <p><u>Building One:</u> Sheets A3.0 and A3.1 depict Building One’s elevations. Sheet A3.0, Front Elevation and the site plan Sheet C100 depicts the view of the structure from the existing home located across from the wetland mitigation area. The placement of windows and patios face directly toward the structure and do not appear to address the standards of this section. Instead, landscaping and fencing are relied upon to address potential impacts. A view shed exhibit was not provided.</p> <p><u>Building Two:</u> Sheets A3.2 and A3.3 depict Building Two’s elevations. According to the site plan Sheet C100, Building Two is obstructed by Building One and Garage G-01 from the view of adjacent single family detached homes. A view shed exhibit was not provided.</p> <p><u>Building Three:</u> Sheet A3.1 depict Building 3’s elevations. According to the site plan Sheet C100, the building is obstructed from the view of adjacent</p>
---	--

single family detached homes by Building 6 and Garage G-02.

Building Four: Sheets A3.2 and A3.3 depict Building Four's elevations. Sheet A1.4 depicts the view shed from an adjacent single-family detached home located at or adjacent to 6054 N. Waterside Place. Sheet A1.4 depicts the proposed view of the adjacent single-family detached home to the third floor at 26' in height. Sheet A3.3, Left Elevation depicts the top of the third floor window at a minimum of 27' 3" and does not take into account additional height from the gaps for non-habitable floor space. As noted above, the application materials are not clear if the height is further raised or not by possible fill pursuant to 8-3B (Flood Hazard).

Building Five: Sheets A3.5 and A3.6 depicts Building Five's elevations, which is a two-story design that transitions to a third story. Sheet A1.2 depicts the view shed from an adjacent single-family detached home located at or adjacent to 6053 N. Waterside Place. Sheet A1.2 depicts the proposed view of the adjacent single-family detached home at 16' in height. Sheet A3.5, Front Elevation depicts the stop of the second story window to at least 18' 2" and does not take into account additional height from the gaps for non-habitable floor space. As noted above, the application materials are not clear if the height is further raised or not by possible fill pursuant to 8-3B (Flood Hazard).

Building Six: Sheets A3.7 and A3.8 depict Building Six's elevations, which is a two-story design that transitions to a third story. Sheet A1.3 depicts the view shed from an adjacent single-family detached home located at or adjacent to 6132 N. Brook Place. Sheet A1.2 depicts the proposed view of the adjacent single-family detached home at 16' in height. Sheet A3.7, Front Elevation depicts the stop of the second story window to at least 18' 2" and does not take into account additional height from the gaps for non-habitable floor space. As noted above, the application materials are not clear if the height is further raised or not by possible fill pursuant to 8-3B (Flood Hazard).

<p>GCC 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Residential Dwelling Units – Building Design</p>	<p>Subsection B.1 requires changes in material types to have a minimum area of 25 sq. ft. The application materials do not contain documentation as to whether this requirement is met.</p> <p>Subsection B.5 requires building materials and finishes that convey an impression of permanence and durability. The ordinance encourages materials such as masonry, stone, stucco, wood, terra cotta, and tile.</p> <p>According to Sheets A3.0 – A3.10, the following materials are proposed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fiber Cement Panel “Smooth Panel” • Fiber Cement Siding “Board & Batten” • Fiber Cement Siding “Lap-Siding” • Vinyl Window • Metal Railing • Asphalt Shingles • Metal Awning • Fiber Cement Facia Board
<p>GCC 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Residential Dwelling Units – Multiple Buildings on One Site</p>	<p>Development of multiple structures requires compliance with subsection 8-4C-4B (Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site). This section is reviewed below.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-4C-4 Special Provisions for Specific Non-residential Development</u></p>	<p style="background-color: black; color: black;">[REDACTED]</p>
<p>GCC 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Non-Residential Structures on One Development Site</p>	<p>Subsection B.4 of this ordinance, as required by 8-4B-4A, requires terminal views within the site be provided to landscaping, landmarks or significant site features. The terminal view facing east from the driveway adjacent to Garage G-03 faces toward Building Four. This could constitute a conflict with this ordinance, as the example provided under Subsection B.4 appears to prohibit such this view.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-4D Parking and Off Street Loading Provisions</u></p>	<p style="background-color: black; color: black;">[REDACTED]</p>

GCC 8-4D-3 Parking Design and Improvement Standards	Subsection A.3c requires parking spaces for a residential unit to be 10' x 20'. Further, garage spaces are to be measured from the exterior dimension. The garage dimensions are not depicted in the application materials. The dimensions of the uncovered residential unit spaces are noted as 9' x 20' in the site plan Sheet C100. This issue will be discussed below in subsection 8-4D-5 (Required Number of Parking Spaces).
GCC 8-4D-4 Parking Use Standards	Ongoing compliance with these standards is required with any use.
GCC 8-4D-5 Required Number of Parking Spaces	<p>Table 8-4D-2 requires the following parking space counts for multi-family developments:</p> <p>One bedroom: 1 space within enclosed garage More than one bedroom: 2 spaces (at least 1 within enclosed garage) Guest parking: .5 spaces per dwelling unit</p> <p>According to the site plan Sheet C100 and the letter of intent, the applicant has proposed 36 one bedroom units and 54 two and three bedroom units. The following parking space counts are required:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required overall dwelling unit spaces: 144 • Minimum garage spaces: 90 • Minimum two or more-bedroom parking uncovered spaces (can also be garaged): 54 • Required guest parking spaces: 45 • Total: 189 <p>The following parking spaces counts are proposed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposed garage spaces: 108 • Proposed uncovered spaces – two or more-bedroom units: 36 • Total proposed dwelling unit spaces: 144 • Proposed uncovered guest parking units: 46 • Total – all parking spaces: 190 (does not count maintenance garage noted in site plan) <p>As noted above, the outdoor uncovered spaces are dimensioned to 9' x 20'. 36 spaces dedicated to the residential units must be 10' x 20'. Guest spaces are not specifically dedicated to a residential unit and do not have a minimum dimension.</p>

	Bicycle parking is requires at 1 space per 20 vehicle spaces. 10 bicycle parking spaces are required for 190 vehicle parking spaces. 152 bicycle parking spaces are proposed.
<u>GCC 8-4E Transportation and Connectivity Provisions</u>	
GCC 8-4E-3 Public Street Connections	<p>The application materials are not clear whether the clear vision triangle is obstructed. More information is needed to determine compliance.</p> <p>Two public street connections are proposed to N. Strawberry Glenn Rd. ACHD approval is required to obtain these access points.</p>
GCC 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards	The site plan Sheet C100 does not depict the driveway width between Garage G-04 and G-05 and the open space adjacent to Building Five.
GCC 8-4E-6 Sidewalk Standards and The Garden City Sidewalk Policy	Pursuant to this subsection and the Garden City Sidewalk Policy, an attached sidewalk is allowed as each end of the property is directly adjacent to an existing attached sidewalk. A 5' attached sidewalk is proposed.
GCC 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards	<p>Subsection A3 requires the pathway system to have appropriate lighting levels. Additional information, such as a photometric plan, is needed to review this requirement.</p> <p>Subsection 7 requires concrete material for the pathway system. Pavers, brick, raised walkways, and other ornamental paving can also be used if the pathway has a smooth finish; textured or bumpy materials may be used as edge treatment provided an accessible route is provided. Additional information concerning the material type is needed to review this requirement.</p>
<u>GCC 8-4I Landscaping and Tree Protection Provisions</u>	
GCC 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions	Subsection A.5 requires a three-foot (3') clearance zone around the circumference of fire hydrants. The landscape plans do not depict the location of fire hydrants and their respective compliance with this ordinance.

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

	<p>Subsection E requires the following minimum plant sizes for all required landscape areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shade Trees and Ornamental Trees: 2-inch caliper • Evergreen Trees: 6-foot minimum • Wood Shrubs: 2-gallon pot minimum <p>The shrubs noted in Sheet L150 do not delineate whether the plantings are woody. More information is needed to determine compliance.</p>
<p>GCC 8-4I-4(B) Landscaping Provisions for Multi-Family Dwelling Units</p>	<p>The standards of this sections appear to have been met, as documented in Sheets L100 and I150.</p>
<p>GCC 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions</p>	<p>Subsection A of this ordinance requires perimeter landscaping to:</p> <p>To provide a visual barrier between different land uses To enhance the streetscape To provide privacy To protect uses from wind, dust, noise, traffic, glare, visual disorder, and harmful or noxious effects</p> <p>As noted above, landscaping is proposed by the applicant to mitigate views between adjacent properties. Pursuant to Subsection B.3, perimeter landscaping is required along the south and west property lines shared by the proposed use and single-family residential uses. According to Sheets L100 and L150, a 15' wide landscape buffer is proposed along the south and west property lines and consisting of the following plantings:</p> <p>West Property Line:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 33 Japanese White Pine Trees • 3 Black Cottonwood Trees • 1 Conifer Tree (12" caliper, species not identified) • Series of Shrubs – Varying Sizes <p>South Property Line:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 17 Japanese White Pine Trees

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 Heritage Birch • 1 Eastern Redbud Multi-Trunk • Series of Shrubs – Varying Sizes <p>Subsection C.2 requires a minimum of 6’ of tree canopy width. The landscape plans do not address the mature canopy width of the Japanese White Pine Tree.</p> <p>Subsection C.3 requires a minimum of 15’ between trees. The landscape plans do not contain spacing information.</p>
<p>GCC 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions</p>	<p>Subsection C.2b requires a minimum 15’ distance between parking lot trees. The landscape plans do not contain spacing information.</p>
<p>GCC 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions</p>	<p>Subsection C.5 requires caliper inch to caliper inch mitigation for all existing trees four-inch (4”) caliper or greater removed from the property unless the trees are certified by a certified arborist as dead, dying or diseased. According to sheet L000 Tree Mitigation, 302 caliper inches are proposed to be certified by an arborist and not required to be mitigated. 35 caliper inches have been proposed for removal without mitigation due to the applicant’s designation of it a prohibited tree within the street buffer. The Garden City Design and Construction Guide has not been drafted and would determine whether a tree is prohibited. The 35 caliper inches are required pursuant to this section.</p> <p>232 caliper inches are proposed to be removed without an arborist certification and require equal mitigation. Sheet L000, Tree Mitigation Calculations proposes mitigating 160 caliper inches. Note A.B within this plan notes that parking, perimeter and open space trees are not included. As noted above, the Garden City Design and Construction Guide has not been drafted and would determine whether a tree is prohibited. The additional 72 caliper inches are required pursuant to this section.</p>
<p><u>GCC 8-4L Open Space Provisions</u></p>	<p style="background-color: black; color: black;">[REDACTED]</p>

GCC 8-4L-3 General Open Space Standards	The application materials do not appear to identify all common open space areas. More information is needed to determine compliance with this section.
GCC 8-4L-5 Open Space Standards for Multi-Family Developments	<p>Garden City Code uses both the terms “Common Area” and “Common Open Space” in the same context. However, only Common Area is defined. Common Area is defined in 8-7A (Definitions) as “Land, complementary structures and/or improvements designed and intended for the common use or enjoyment of the residents of the development. The area can include, but is not limited to: turf areas, playgrounds, patios, courtyards, barbecue and picnic areas, water areas, and community gardens.” For the purposes of this review, the term “Common Open Space” will be used.</p> <p>Subsection A requires a minimum of 80 sq. ft. of private open space for each dwelling unit. According to Sheets A2.0 – A2.6, the minimum private open space has been proposed.</p> <p>Subsection B.1 requires the following minimum common open space square footages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 150 sq. ft. for each unit containing 500 sq. ft. or less of living area • 250 sq. ft. for each unit containing 500 sq. ft. to 1,200 sq. ft. of living area • 350 sq. ft. for each unit exceeding 1,200 sq. ft. of living area <p>According to the Compliance Statement, Base Zoning Provisions, the applicant has noted there are 84 units containing 500 sq. ft. to 1,200 sq. ft. and 6 units exceeding 1,200 sq. ft. of living area. This is further verified per the unit square footage tables on Sheets A2.0 – A2.6. A total of 23,100 sq. ft. of common open space is required pursuant to this ordinance.</p> <p>The Compliance Statement, Base Zoning Provisions notes a total of 31,238 sq. ft. of common open space has been provided. However, the application documents do not specifically document or label these common open space areas.</p> <p>More information is needed concerning what is</p>

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

	designated as a common open space. The Community Building depicted in the site plan C100 is proposed at 1,459 sq. ft and would qualify as a common open space. The plaza depicted in the application documents would also qualify as common open space, but more information is needed concerning its dimensions.
<u>GCC 8-6B-3 Design Review</u>	
GCC 8-6B-3D Required Findings	Design Review approval may be granted by the Committee only if the applicant meets the required findings of this section. The findings are analyzed below.
Finding 1	<p>Finding: The project conforms to all applicable standards and criteria as set forth in Title 8, Chapter 4.</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-4A-4 Outdoor Lighting • 8-4A-5 Outdoor Service and Equipment Areas • 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Dwelling Units • 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site • 8-4D-3 Parking Design and Improvement Standards • 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards • 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions • 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions • 8-4L-3 General Open Space Standards • 8-4L-5 Open Space Standards for Multi-Family Developments
Finding 2A	Finding: The proposed design is in accordance with the purpose of the zoning district and all dimensional regulations of that district;

	<p>Analysis: The proposal appears to meet the purpose statement for the R-3 Medium Density Residential District as noted in 8-2B-1A.</p>
<p>Finding 2B</p>	<p>Finding: The proposed design adheres to standards for the protection of health, safety, and general welfare;</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family • 8-4A-4 Outdoor Lighting • 8-4A-5 Outdoor Service and Equipment Areas • 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Dwelling Units • 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site • 8-4D-3 Parking Design and Improvement Standards • 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards • 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions • 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions • 8-4L-3 General Open Space Standards • 8-4L-5 Open Space Standards for Multi-Family Developments
<p>Finding 2C</p>	<p>Finding: The proposed design creates a sense of place and contributes to the uniqueness of the different districts and neighborhoods in the city;</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family • 8-4A-4 Outdoor Lighting • 8-4A-5 Outdoor Service and Equipment Areas • 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Dwelling Units • 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-4D-3 Parking Design and Improvement Standards • 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards • 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions • 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions • 8-4L-3 General Open Space Standards • 8-4L-5 Open Space Standards for Multi-Family Developments
Finding 2D	<p>Finding: The proposed design improves the accessibility of development to non-motorized and public modes of transportation;</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family • 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site • 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards
Finding 2E	<p>Finding: The proposed design supports a development pattern in nodes rather than strip commercial along arterial corridors;</p> <p>Analysis: Not applicable. The proposed design is not located along an arterial corridor.</p>
Finding 2F	<p>Finding: The proposed design supports a compact development pattern that enables intensification of development and changes over time; and</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-2C-15 Dwelling Unit, Multiple Family • 8-4B-4A Multi-Family Dwelling Units

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-4C-4(B) Multiple Nonresidential Structures on One Development Site • 8-4D-3 Parking Design and Improvement Standards • 8-4E-4 Internal Circulation Standards • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards • 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions • 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions • 8-4L-3 General Open Space Standards • 8-4L-5 Open Space Standards for Multi-Family Developments
<p>Finding 2G:</p>	<p>Finding: The proposed design provides outdoor spaces and landscaping compatible with the southwest Idaho climatic conditions and that encourage pedestrian activity.</p> <p>Analysis: As noted in this review, more information is needed to determine compliance with this finding. Specifically, the following subsections of this Title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-4E-7 Pedestrian and Bicycle Accessibility Standards • 8-4I-3 General Landscaping Standards and Irrigation Provisions • 8-4I-5 Perimeter Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-6 Parking Lot Landscaping Provisions • 8-4I-7 Tree Preservation Provisions

C. Policy and Study Analysis

<p style="text-align: center;">POLICIES AND STUDIES</p>	
<p>Document</p>	<p>Staff Comments</p>
<p><u>Garden City Sidewalk Policy</u></p>	<p>The sidewalk policy allows an attached sidewalk when a property is bordered on both sides by an existing attached sidewalk.</p>

STAFF REPORT: DSRFY2019-23 – Application materials can be found here: [Link](#)

<u>Garden City Street Light Policy</u>	Streetlight locations pursuant to this policy were not identified. Additional information is needed to review this policy.
<u>Greenbelt Easements</u>	The property contains an installed Greenbelt improvement at the northeast corner. A written easement has not been found on file for this improvement. A prescriptive easement is apparent by the location, duration, and use of the Greenbelt improvement.

D. Pre-Application Conference Options

The Design Committee may take one of the following actions:

- 1. Determine the application is ready for an administrative decision;
- 2. Determine the application is ready for a Design Committee formal application;
- 3. Request the applicant return with revised materials for additional review;