

BEFORE THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION
GARDEN CITY, ADA COUNTY, IDAHO

In the Matter of:)	CUPFY2024 - 0003
)	
Conditional Use Permit)	FINDINGS OF FACT,
3433 W. Chinden Blvd.)	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW
)	AND DECISION
Garden City, Ada County, Idaho)	
_____)	

THIS MATTER, came before the Garden City Planning And Zoning Commission for consideration on March 20, 2024. The Planning and Zoning Commission reviewed the application and materials submitted. Based on the evidence presented, pursuant to Garden City Code Table 8-6A-1, the Planning and Zoning Commission makes the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The request is for the use of Lodging defined by Garden City Code 8-7A-1 as “The use of a site providing visitor or overnight accommodations, including sleeping rooms, sanitary facilities, guest registration and lobby areas. The term "lodging" shall include motels, hotels and inns.”
2. The applicant is Chris Anderson.
3. The property owner of record is ELEVATE CHINDEN LLC.
4. The location of the project is 3433 W. Chinden Blvd.; Ada County Assessor parcel number(s) R2734530170; W 10' OF LOT 2 LOT 3 LOT 32 E 20' OF LOT 33 BLK M FAIRVIEW ACRES SUB 4 #9042804.
5. Legal Lot of Record: Unable to determine.
6. The subject property is 0.45 acres.
7. The scope of the request applies to the office remodel and site improvements.
8. The project is located in the C-1 Highway commercial zoning district.
9. The project is located in the Activity Node: Neighborhood Destination; Green Boulevard Corridor ; Live-Work-Create of the Garden City Comprehensive Plan Land Use Designation.

10. The project is in the:
 - a) 500 Year of the Special Flood Hazard Area according to the 2020 adopted FIRM (the FIRM has adopted seclusion and utilizes the 2003 Flood Insurance Study).
 - b) 100 Year of the Special Flood Hazard Area according to FEMA's most recent model as adopted by resolution 1083-20.

11. The existing use on the site is Lodging.

12. The following standards apply to this proposal:
 - a. Garden City Code 8-1A-4 Applicability
 - b. Garden City Code 8-1B Existing Nonconforming Properties, Structures, and Uses
 - c. Garden City Code 8-2B Base Zoning District Regulations
 - d. Garden City Code 8-2C Land Use Provisions
 - e. Garden City Code 8-4A Design and Development Regulations- General Provisions
 - f. Garden City Code 8-4D Parking and Off Street Loading Provisions
 - g. Garden City Code 8-4E Transportation and Connectivity Provisions
 - h. Garden City Code 8-4I Landscaping and Tree Protection Provisions
 - i. Garden City Code 8-6A Administration

13. The following plans and policies apply to this proposal:
 - a. Garden City Comprehensive Plan
 - b. Garden City Sidewalk Policy
 - c. Garden City Street Light Policy
 - d. Chinden ITD Access Management
 - e. Garden City Transportation Needs
 - f. Old Town Circulation Network Plan

14. The following previous approvals apply to this proposal:
 - a. DSRFY2022-0030

15. Required materials per Garden City Code Table 8-6A-2 Required Application Information was provided:

Conditional Use Permit			
Provided			
Yes	No	NA	
X			Compliance Statement
X			Neighborhood Map
X			Will Serve

16. Additional application materials submitted include:
 - a. Application;
 - b. Affidavit of Legal Interest;

- c. Statement of Intent.
- d. 300' Neighborhood List;
- e. Site Plan;
- f. Floor Plans;
- g. Materials Plan;
- h. Grading Plan;
- i. Landscape Plan;
- j. Demolition Plans.

17. Agency Comments were received from:

- a. Ada County Highway District, January 11th, 2024
- b. Garden City Engineer, January 6th, 2024
- c. Republic Services, January 3rd, 2024
- d. North Ada County Fire and Rescue, January 4th, 2024.
- e. Department of Environmental Quality January 10th, 2024

18. Public comments were received from:

- a. Angela Bauter, February 20th, 2024
- b. Sue Bauter, February 20th, 2024
- c. Francis Fallon, February 21st, 2024

19. The following noticing was completed in accordance with GCC 8-6A-7:

Noticing Requirement	Required Date	Completion Date
Receipt of application		12/14/2023
Letter of Acceptance	1/14/2024	12/29/2023
Radius Notice	3/5/2024	1/3/2024
Legal Notice	3/1/2024	1/5/2024
Agency Notice	3/5/2024	1/3/2024
Property Posting Sign	3/10/2024	2/29/2024
Affidavit of Property Posting and Photos	3/13/2024	2/29/2024

20. On February 21, 2024, a public hearing before the Planning and Zoning Commission was held. The application was continued to March 20, 2024, due to noticing errors.

21. On March 20, 2024, a public hearing before the Planning and Zoning Commission was held:

- a. Chris Anderson and Elizabeth Koeckeritz presented the application
 - i. The applicant has requested that 28 of the rooms be granted occupancy based on the currently proposed parking, and that the City hold issuing occupancy for two of the rooms until which time that the 22nd vehicular parking space is provided.
- b. Staff, Hanna Veal, presented the staff report.

- c. Public testimony was heard from:
 - i. Demetre Booker in favor; representing owner ship of Arcadia and the Art Block.
 - ii. Chelsea Santiago favor; historical preservation, built in 1958.
 - iii. Tin Le in favor; representing ownership of Arcadia.
- d. There was no rebuttal.
- e. Public testimony was closed.
- f. Discussion included:
 - i. The Commissioners were in favor of the application.
 - ii. Discussion regarding waiving the parking requirements, allowing for the deficiency of one (1) vehicular parking space on-site based on the special circumstances per Garden City Code 8-4D-6.B.
 - iii. The request for a parking adjustment is granted based on 8-4D-6.B.1 findings:
 - 1) A. There are special circumstances that warrant a waiver, including
 - a. The historical nature of the property and the structure.
 - b. Stockton itself is akin to an alley. Stockton is an existing inadequate right-of-way for a two-way street.
 - c. Chinden Blvd. has an existing bus route and ride share is available which will reduce the parking demand.
 - 2) B. Use will be adequately served as demonstrated by historic use.
 - 3) C. No impact on public parking, adjacent property parking, and is adequately parked as proposed.
 - 4) D. There is no other possible use for the property.
 - 5) E. It will not affect another property.
 - 6) F. No administration or burden to the city.
 - iv. Drafted condition of approval #3.b under scope of the permit shall be removed to allow occupancy of the requested three (3) ADA rooms, so long as the shared parking agreement with adjacent businesses in the area is pursued.
- g. Commissioner Sheppard moved to approve the application as drafted in the draft decision in the affirmative, with draft conditions of approval, with the following modifications to the conditions of approval:
 - i. Drafted condition of approval #3.b under scope of the permit shall be removed to allow occupancy of the requested three (3) ADA rooms, so long as the shared parking agreement with adjacent businesses in the area is pursued.
- h. Commission Member Smith seconded the motion.
- i. The motion carried unanimously.

22. The record contains:

- a. Application Documents
- b. Noticing Documents
- c. Agency Comments
- d. Written Public Comments
- e. Staff report
- f. February 21, 2024, Planning and Zoning Commission Hearing Minutes and Audio
- g. March 20, 2024, Planning and Zoning Commission Hearing Minutes and Audio
- h. Planning and Zoning Commission Signed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision

23. In order to approve a conditional use permit application, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall make the following findings:

GCC 8-6B-2 CONDITIONAL USE: REQUIRED FINDINGS			
Conclusion			
Compliant	Not Applicable to this Application	Not Compliant	Standard
X			<p>Finding 1. The use is appropriate to the location, the lot, and the neighborhood, and is compatible with the uses permitted in the applicable zoning district;</p> <p>Explanation: The application is cohesive with the Comprehensive Plan’s designation of Live-Work-Create by maintaining the existing structure(s). The proposal to improve the W. Chinden Blvd. streetscape is compatible with the vision set forth in the Green Boulevard Corridor designation. And maintaining the lodging use while improving the property further develops the area as a neighborhood destination.</p> <p>The use is appropriate to the location, lot, and the neighborhood and is compatible with uses within the C-1 Highway Commercial.</p>
X			<p>Finding 2. The use will be supported by adequate public facilities or services to the surrounding area, or conditions can be established to mitigate adverse impacts;</p>

			Explanation: There are public services available that can accommodate the proposed development.
X			Finding 3. The use will not unreasonably diminish either the health, safety or welfare of the community; Explanation: The application has been sufficiently conditioned to not unreasonably diminish either the health, safety, or welfare of the community.
X			Finding 4. The use is no in conflict with the comprehensive plan or other adopted plans, policies or ordinances of the city. Explanation: As conditioned, this application is in conformance with applicable sections of the Garden City Code and the Comprehensive Plan.

18. The record was reviewed by the Planning and Zoning Commission to render the decision.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Planning and Zoning Commission reviewed the application with regard to Garden City Code Title 8, and based on the conditions required herein, concludes the application **meets** the standards of approval under **GCC 8-6B-2 Conditional Use**.

DECISION

WHEREFORE, based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law contained herein, the Planning and Zoning Commission hereby **APPROVES** of the application subject to the following conditions:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL DECISION

Application Specific Requirements:

Scope of Permit:

1. The scope of this permit is to allow for the use of Lodging.

- a. Thirty (30) lodging rooms are permitted as a part of this conditional use permit.
2. Limitations for the use:
 - a. A maximum of 60% of the lodging units may contain a kitchen.
 - b. Lodging guestrooms shall not be provided on less than a daily basis.
3. The request for a parking adjustment is granted based on 8-4D-6.B.1 findings:
 - a. (A.) There are special circumstance that warrant a waiver, including:
 - i. The historical nature of the property and the structure.
 - ii. Stockton itself is akin to an alley. Stockton is an existing inadequate right-of-way for a two-way street.
 - iii. Chinden Blvd. has an existing bus route and ride share is available which will reduce the parking demand.
 - b. (B.) Use will be adequately served as demonstrated by historic use.
 - c. (C.) No impact on public parking, adjacent property parking, and is adequately parked as proposed.
 - d. (D.) There is no other possible use for the property.
 - e. (E.) It will not affect another property.
 - f. (F.) No administration or burden to the city.
4. The applicant shall demonstrate that a shared vehicular parking agreement with adjacent properties has been pursued.
5. The site shall provide at least 21 vehicular parking spaces either on-site or through a shared parking agreement in accordance with Garden City Code 8-4D.
 - a. The three proposed vehicular parking spaces adjacent to Stockton Street must be reverse-in spaces so that the vehicles can travel in a forward motion when entering the right-of-way.
 - b. Provided that all other requirements are met, all 3 ADA rooms may receive occupancy so long as the 21 vehicular parking spaces that are currently proposed are provided.
 - c. The dimensional standards for parking spaces are to be shown on site plans, and be compliant with table 8-4D-1 of Garden City Code 8-4D-3.
 - d. In no instances shall motor vehicle parking for nonresidential uses be located more than one-fourth (0.25) mile from the use, measured as walked, rather measured from the shortest distance on the map, via public right-of-way or easement as otherwise dedicated to the public.
 - e. There must be continuous, code-compliant sidewalk that connects the use to the parking.
6. The site shall provide at least 22 bicycle parking spaces in accordance with Garden City Code 8-4D.

7. At least two (2) tree species and 13 shrubs are required as per Garden City Code 8-4I-3 and 8-4I-4.

Prior to Occupancy:

1. Occupancy of the site shall not commence until after a Certificate of Occupancy has been obtained from Garden City Development Services Department.
2. New site and landscape plans shall be submitted to the city for design review consultation review per conditions of approval for DSRFY2022-0030.
 - a. All site improvements shall be made as proposed, or otherwise altered to meet code compliance, or design review consultation comments.
 - b. All conditions set forth in DSRFY2021-0030 shall be met.
3. Evidence to support that the lot is or is not of legal record shall be submitted to the city.
 - a. Additional permitting processes shall proceed the determination of an illegal lot of record.

General Requirements

1. Any changes in the design, construction, operation, or use shall be brought to the immediate attention of the Planning Official for determination if the changes are in substantial conformance with the City's action. Any changes to the plans and specifications upon which this approval is based, other than those required by the above conditions, will require submittal of an application for modification and approval of that application prior to commencing any change.
2. This Conditional Use Permit shall not be transferable from one parcel of land to another. Unless otherwise stated in the conditions attached to a permit, the permit shall be granted to the applicant and successors in interest to the premises for which it was approved.
3. This approval is only approval of the conditional use permit. All other applicable permits must be obtained and completed prior to a certificate of compliance or occupancy.
4. The approval is specific to the application provided and reviewed. Final approval is based on substantial conformance. Any changes to the plans and specifications upon which this approval is based, other than those required by the above conditions, will require submittal of an application for modification and approval of that application prior to commencing any change.
5. Final approval is subject to the approval of other reviewing agencies and City Departments. Any more restrictive standards adopted and made applicable by any Transportation Authority, Fire Authority or other Federal, State or Local regulatory agencies shall prevail.
6. All improvements and operations shall comply with applicable local, state and federal requirements and procedures whether specifically addressed in the analysis of this application or not. This shall include but not be limited to 8-4A General Provisions of Design and Development Regulations.
7. The property owner is responsible to maintain the site to edge of roadway asphalt.

8. If there are any tree grates, they shall be widened to accommodate the growing tree trunk and prevent girdling of any trees planted in tree wells within sidewalks or other public right of way.
9. Plant materials which exhibit evidence of insect pests, disease, and/or damage shall be appropriately treated to correct the problem. Dead and diseased plant materials shall be replaced.
10. Where landscaping might impact motorist or pedestrian sight distance, shrubs shall be maintained below three feet (3') in height and trees shall be pruned so that the lowest branches will be at least seven feet (7') above the ground level.
11. A three foot (3') clearance zone shall be maintained around the circumference of fire hydrants.
12. Retain and protect existing trees, vegetation, and native soils and integrate these features into the overall landscape plan as required by or exempted from Garden City Code 8-4I and as shown in the approved landscape plans.
13. If trees are staked, the stakes shall be removed within twelve (12) months to prevent damage to the tree.
14. All planting areas that border driveways, parking lots, and other vehicle use areas shall be protected by curbing, wheel stops, or other approved protective devices.
15. Trees shall be planted at least three feet (3') from curbs, sidewalks, driveways and other hard surfaces to buffer from stress caused by vehicle overhang and compacted soils, or planted with sufficient space to provide for the full maturity of the particular tree species. All other plant material, except sod or ground cover, shall be set back a minimum of one foot (1') from any curb edge to protect from vehicle overhang and mechanical damage.
16. The landscape installation shall stabilize all soil and slopes.
17. All required landscaping shall be provided with an automatically controlled irrigation system in conformance with the best management practices for automatic irrigation systems.
18. Demonstrate compliance with or an exemption from Garden City Code 8-4G prior to certificate of occupancies.
19. This approval is for this application only. Additional permits, licenses and approvals may be necessary.
20. Property maintenance standards shall be maintained as required by Garden City Code.
21. The property owner is responsible for the maintenance of all landscaping and screening devices required.
22. All outdoor lighting shall comply with Garden City Code 8-4A-4.
23. All outdoor service and equipment areas shall comply with Garden City Code 8-4A-5 Outdoor Service and Equipment Areas.
24. All stormwater systems must comply with Garden City Code 8-4A-7.
25. All utilities shall comply with Garden City Code 8-4A-8.
26. Cross-Connections: All cross-connections between the domestic water lines and the irrigation water lines shall be in accord with the City's adopted standards, specifications and ordinances.
27. Materials submitted after the decision shall not be considered part of the record for this decision. If additional materials or information is submitted after the decision

the application may be remanded to the decision-making body during which time the decision shall be stayed provided that there is no immediate threat to life or safety.

28. No change in terms and conditions of this approval shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his or her authorized representative and an authorized representative of the reviewing agency. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon Garden City.
29. The Commission may revoke a conditional use permit for any of the following: A) Violation of Garden City Code or State or Federal Laws; B) Failure to abide by any conditions of this permit; C) Causing or allowing a nuisance as determined by Garden City Code, in connection with the use for which the permit is granted.
30. Any violation of the conditions of this application is a criminal offence.
31. A certificate of occupancy or an application for a building permit shall be considered commencement of the use.
32. All previous uses are null and void unless otherwise conditioned.
33. Should there be a change in use, there is a clear intent to cease the use, or the use is discontinued for more than one year without written documentation submitted to the City, legal noticing, and property posting indicating intent to continue the use, this approval shall become void.
34. The date of action is the date the decision body formalizes their decision. The decision body may formalize their decision by approving a draft decision or a draft decision with noted changes at the hearing. The date of action may be a different date than the applicant is provided with a signed copy of the decision.
35. Pursuant to 8-6A-9 Appeals, those with standing may appeal a decision within fifteen days from the date of action.
36. This approval shall expire one (1) year from its approval, unless otherwise extended as allowed by Garden City Code .
37. Final decisions are subject to judicial review pursuant to The Local Land Use Planning Act, Chapter 65 Title 67 Idaho Code.
38. Pursuant to Idaho Code, a request for reconsideration must be submitted within 14 days of the final decision and prior to judicial review. The written request must identify specific deficiencies in the decision for which reconsideration is sought.
39. A takings analysis pursuant to Idaho Code may be requested on final decisions.
40. If any term or provision of this decision, to any extent, is held invalid or unenforceable, the remaining terms and provisions hereof shall not be affected thereby, but each such remaining term and provision shall be valid and enforced to the fullest extent permitted by law.


Chairman, Planning and Zoning Commission

March 20, 2024

Date