

BEFORE THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE  
GARDEN CITY, ADA COUNTY, IDAHO

In the Matter of:	)	CUPFY2018-7, Res. 1061-19
	)	
Garden City Comprehensive Plan	)	
Amendment	)	FINDINGS OF FACT,
	)	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW;
	)	AND DECISION
_____	)	

THIS MATTER came before the Garden City Design Review Committee for consideration on April 15, 2019. The Design Review Committee reviewed the materials submitted. Based on the evidence presented, pursuant to Garden City Code Table 8-6A-1, the Design Review Committee makes the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision:

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

1. Between November 7, 2018 and March 28, 2019 a Working Group consisting of a wide representation from Garden City residents, commerce, non-profit, and public agencies met nine times to evaluate and make recommendations of changes to the Garden City Comprehensive Plan. All meetings were open to the public.
2. A neighborhood meeting was noticed on February 11, 2019. The meeting was held on March 18, 2019 from 5:00 pm to 7:00 pm at Garden City Hall. There were 60 members of the public or affected public agencies in attendance.
3. During the neighborhood meeting on March 18, 2019 there were 13 comment cards submitted, as well as 930 stickers noting importance on identified goals and objectives, and 120 comments related to specific components of the working draft plan. Additional comments were received from A. Fogleman, J. Jackson Heim, P. Beaumont, S. Vader, and B. Taunton.
4. Work sessions were held with the Garden City Planning and Zoning Commission on April 17, 2019 and with the Garden City Design Review Committee on March 18, 2019 and April 1, 2019.
5. The amendments were noticed in accordance with Garden City Code 8-6A and Idaho Code § 67-6507.
  - a) A copy of the draft proposal was transmitted to interested and affected public agencies on March 22, 2019 and written comments were not received from any agency.
  - b) A Public Service Announcement (PSA) noting the time, place, summary of the plan, and a copy of the proposed changes were provided to interested parties, local television news stations, the Idaho Statesman as well as other print

news organizations and Home Owners Associations of record within Garden City on March 22, 2019.

- c) The Garden City Chamber of Commerce was notified on March 26, 2019. Agency notice provided on March 22, 2019.
- d) Notice of the meeting was posted at the Garden City Hall lobby, Garden City Library, and Garden City Police Department on March 22, 2019.
- e) Public hearing notices for the proposed application noting the time, place, and summary of the plan were published in the Idaho Statesman, the official newspaper of circulation for Garden City, on March 29, 2019.

6. The following statute applies to this proposal:

Standards	Compliant	Conclusions
<b>Idaho Code § 67-6503 Local Land Use Planning</b>		
<b>Idaho Code § 67-6508 Local Land Use Planning</b>	Yes	<p><i>There has been a comprehensive planning process conducted.</i></p> <p><i>The plan includes all land within the jurisdiction.</i></p> <p><i>The amendment considers conditions, trends, compatibility of land uses, desirable goals and objectives, or desirable future situations for each planning component or specifies reasons why a particular component is unneeded. The elements considered include but are not limited to: property rights; population; School facilities and transport; economic development; land use; natural resources; hazardous areas; public services, facilities, and utilities; transportation; recreation; special areas or sites; housing; community design; agriculture; implementation; national interest electric transmission corridors; and public airport facilities.</i></p>

7. The Garden City Design Review Committee reviewed the proposal on April 15, 2019 and recommended approval as drafted with changes.

8. During the Design Review Committee on April 15, 2019:

- a. Staff member Jenah Thornborrow represented the proposed amendments.
- b. Written comment were received from:
  - i. Bob Taunton, Glass Creek LLC
  - ii. Craig Quintana, Save Plantation Coalition
  - iii. Lewis Williams
  - iv. Karen Knudtsen
  - v. Andrea Fogleman
- c. During the public hearing testimony was received from:
  - i. Bob Taunton, representing Glass Creek LLC- requesting that Plantation Country Club be designated as a Future Planning Area, not including the areas ‘fingerling’ areas that run through residences; page 35 Existing and Proposed Green Space/ Open Space is written in such a way that there is a question of private property rights in that there is only one golf course in Garden City and it notes that it “should be preserved”.
  - ii. Andrea Fogleman- identifying that there is not text identifying a land use designation for the property north of the river east of Glenwood. She supported leaving the area out of the Future Planning Area designation.
  - iii. Wendy Carver-Herbert-requested that adjacent neighborhoods are included in 5.1; wants to ensure that parking is directed to public spaces not neighborhoods in 5.1.2; and requests that an action step for storm water management as a system be included.
  - iv. Craig Quintana-noted that the Future Park, Open Space is the proper designation for the Plantation Country Club area and opposes the designation of Future Planning Area.
  - v. Joanne Butler- Does not feel that the Future Land Designation would tip the area to redevelopment. She indicated that the State Street Corridor plan implementation is already in motion and will cause redevelopment; the Plantation Country Club is private property not a public park.
  - vi. Mike Nero-Supports designating the Plantation Country Club area as open space.
  - vii. Pierce Roan- Opposes any development of Plantation Country Club. Does not support the designation of a Future Planning Area.
- d. The Public Hearing was closed.
- e. During discussion the committee:
  - i. Reviewed each suggested change from the Design Review Committee work session, ITD, and public comment received from Glass Creek LLC and identified which they were in concurrence with as well as identifying any other changes that they intended on recommending based on testimony.
  - ii. The committee discussed that the Green Boulevard Corridor and Activity Node designations assume that there

can be redevelopment of the Plantation Country Club in accordance with those land use designations. They were unclear as to how deep the Green Boulevard Corridor designation is.

- f. The Committee recommended approval with changes noted on a unanimous vote.
9. The record contains:
- a. Noticing documents:
    - i. Agency Review Transmittal
    - ii. Public Service Announcement
    - iii. Public Notice
    - iv. Legal Advertisement in Idaho Statesman
  - b. Applicable minutes from:
    - i. Design Review Committee meetings March 18, 2019, April 1, 2019, and April 15, 2019.
  - c. Staff reports, and referenced materials
  - d. Agency Comments
  - e. Public Comments
  - f. Signed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

The Design Review Committee reviewed the application and concludes the proposal meet the standards of approval under Garden City Code Title 8 and Idaho Code § 67-65.

### **DECISION**

WHEREFORE, based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the Garden City Design Review Committee does hereby recommend **APPROVAL** of amendments to the 2006 Garden City Comprehensive Plan and Future Land Use Map; file CPAFY2018-7 with the following additional changes:

- The map should say “Transit Oriented Development”.
- Brett Labrie is the correct spelling-page 3.
- Add a more obvious key to explain font and shading.
- Priorities needed for all action steps, and language should match action steps. Specifically noted missing steps in the prioritization table include:5.2.4 and 5.3.2.
- Add an action step to address stormwater management as a system.
- 1.5.4 Establish a program which would allow for trees, benches, street lamps, public art and gardens, to be dedicated.
- 2.1.5 Explore an amendment to the Development Code to expand the boundaries of the Surel Mitchell Live-Work-Create District that would serve as a tool to promote the district.
- 2.4.2 Encourage the transportation agencies (Ada County Highway District, Idaho Department of Transportation, and Valley Regional Transit) through meetings, presentations, and education. to adopt and implement Garden City street standards as developed in Action Step 2.4.1
- Prepare and adopt a master plan for parks, green spaces and recreation. The

plan should contain:

- standards for green space and park requirements;
  - identification of locations in the city that don't meet the standards; and
  - amend the adopted Parks and Waterway Plan to include strategies for investment in the parks including requirements for new development, and/or the imposition of impact fees to fund new parks and green spaces.
- 3.2.1 Conduct an inventory of public and private property in locations that can become centers of neighborhood activity. These areas may be undeveloped or vacant property, parks, street ends, or plazas. Explore the purchase and secure easements for use of these areas as neighborhood gathering places.
  - 4.1.1 Prepare and adopt a master plan for parks, green spaces and recreation. The plan should contain:
    - standards for green space and park requirements;
    - identification of locations in the city that don't meet the standards; and
    - amend the adopted Parks and Waterway Plan to include strategies for investment in the parks including requirements for new development, and/or the imposition of impact fees to fund new parks and green spaces.
  - 4.1.8 Explore if the Development Code should be amended to include an Open Space zoning district.
  - 5.2.2 Encourage appropriate landscaping materials along the river. Based on hazardous conditions and riparian health, allow for limited pruning of vegetation and clean-up of riverbanks. Protect native plants and trees and prohibit any activity that would destabilize the river bank.
  - 5.3 Objective: Restore and naturalize water systems, including canals, drains, river channels, ditches, and creeks.
  - 5.3.1 Amend the Land Use Code to create incentives for opening closed water systems. Discourage the covering and/or tiling of any water systems. Require mitigation of the impacts that closing water systems have on the ground water and habitat.
  - 5.3.2 Respect the historic nature of manmade water systems as a source of water and an amenity to the city. Work to identify ownership of the irrigation canals, ditches and drains rights-of-way. Work with the Irrigation Districts to restore, undertake weed abatement and better maintain the banks of the canals, ditches and drains. Protect existing easements.
  - 5.3.3 Support community organizations such as Boise River Enhancement Network (BREN), surf and paddle clubs, etc. that promote the health, clean up, and maintenance of the Boise River and water systems.
  - 5.7 Define the greenbelt as either being the natural river corridor area or the portion of the corridor with a pathway.
  - 5.7.1 Explore options with other entities for a dedicated funding source for maintaining the greenbelt.
  - 7.1.4 Complete a Garden City specific plan including street design and designations, prioritized projects, potential funding, and responsibilities for implementation.
  - 7.2.3 Support efforts of Valley Regional Transit for fixed transit stops, bus turn-outs, and more frequent service as financially feasible.

- 7.2.5 Partner with ITD, ACHD and Valley Regional Transit on a corridor plan for Chinden Boulevard with these objectives:
  - to improve the design of Chinden Boulevard emphasizing multi-modal facilities, including consideration for stations at the transit nodes;
  - to maintain vehicular mobility and traffic flow in balance with other transportation modes;
  - to improve the convenience for both drivers and pedestrians.
  - to improve the accessibility across the corridor for local connectivity;
  - to improve the appearance of the corridor; and
  - to improve multi-modal access from streets intersecting with Chinden.
- 7.3.1 Encourage a grid pattern of local streets over cul-de-sacs and dead-end streets without non-motorized connections through maximum block lengths, connecting stub streets, and reducing the number of cul-de-sacs
- 7.4.3 Work with the Fire District and Ada County Highway District to develop alternative design and development standards to create safer and neighborly local streets appropriate for the use.
- 7.4.4 Develop alternative design and development standards to create safer and neighborly internal streets appropriate for the use.
- 10.2.1 Amend the Land Use Code to create a new zoning district to allow for live-work-create activities in the Old Town Site. The new zoning district would have the following objectives:
  - to direct future development through form and design, not separation of uses;
  - to maintain the fine grain lot size and development pattern by controlling building footprint or square footage of building to lot size; and
  - to control large scale industrial or commercial uses.
- 10.4 Objective: Designate locations in proximity to existing and future transit stops throughout the city that serve as activity centers.
- 10.4.1 Amend the zoning code to facilitate transit-oriented development nodes along the arterial roadways as designated on the Land Use Map and described in the Land Use Designation, and also follow the State Street Corridor Study recommendations.
- 10.4.2 Amend the zoning code to facilitate destination and neighborhood centers that draw people to the location and are supported by transit as designated on the Land Use Map and described in the Land Use Designation for activity nodes
- Delete current 10.4.3
- 10.5 Objective Create a “Main Street” corridor with commercial nodes as designated on the Land Use Map and described in the Land Use Designation.
- 12.3.3 utilize consistent terminology as used throughout plan rather than “east gateway”.
- Land Use Designations are recommended to be the same as the draft except for the designations as identified below:
 

Specific wording to Green Boulevard Corridor was not recommended, however, it was noted that it should be clear that future commercial is anticipated.

**MAIN STREET CORRIDOR:** Create a “Main Street” corridor as a principle street through the City with a mix and concentration of uses. The corridor

should have activity nodes along the street that connect the main street to the arterial roadways and/or the Boise River. The activity nodes should be limited so as to not dilute their function as a center.

The focus of development should be on minimum front yard setbacks, parking on the street and behind buildings, and pedestrian amenities. The center of the activity nodes on the Main Street corridor should be integrated vertically with more height at the principle main street intersection of the node.

**LIVE-WORK-CREATE:** The live-work-create district is in the Old Town Site generally between 32<sup>nd</sup> to 37<sup>th</sup> Streets with a possible expansion, based on further study. This designation reflects an opportunity to create an Arts District within the city where artists, crafts persons, or others can live, work, exhibit, and operate a business. A mix of uses, including residential, retail, office and small-scale industrial are appropriate for this area. Regulation should be primarily through form not uses, including maintaining the existing subdivision pattern of small lots, and limiting the maximum building footprint or square footage of a building in relation to lot size. Large scale development that consolidates lots and allows for larger scale industrial or commercial uses should be restricted.

**ACTIVITY NODE:** Activity nodes are identified on the Land Use Map for neighborhood centers, local and regional destinations, and locations in proximity to existing and future transit stations and stops. Activity centers range in size depending on their function and location. Some nodes may be centered on the intersection of major streets or extend down a street to connect major community facilities. The common characteristics of the activity nodes are a mix of uses, public spaces, compatible transition to the uses surrounding the nodes and non-motorized connections to within a quarter mile walkable area of the node center. Some nodes, especially around transit stations, would have higher density (at least 14-20 units per acre) and multi-story development (three or more stories). It is not intended that all nodes could be developed within the twenty-year period of the plan.

Activity Nodes by type shown on the Land Use Map are as follows:

Neighborhood and Destination Centers: The centers should be focused on uses that facilitate making the location a destination. Uses may include small scale retail, art, office, and higher density residential. Identified centers are:

- Adams and 50<sup>th</sup> Streets intersection to the Boise River
- Adams and 42<sup>nd</sup> street intersection to the Boise River.
- East city boundary to 36<sup>th</sup> street between the Boise River and Chinden Boulevard

- Glenwood and Marigold Streets intersection
- Chinden Boulevard and Garrett Street intersection
- Chinden Boulevard and 50<sup>th</sup> Street intersection
- State Street and Pierce Park

#### Transit Oriented Development Nodes

- Chinden Boulevard and Glenwood Street intersection
- Chinden Boulevard and Veterans Parkway intersection
- State Street and Horseshoe Bend Road
- State Street and Glenwood Street

**LIGHT INDUSTRIAL BRADLEY TECHNOLOGY DISTRICT:** The light industrial designation reflects intent to maintain the area of existing industrial uses, around Bradley Street and north of Chinden. Industrial development includes: materials processing and assembly, product manufacturing, storage of finished products, and truck terminals. Manufacturing support facilities such as offices and research related activities should also be allowed in this area, but other non-industrial uses should be limited. Major consideration in regulating industrial uses should be setbacks, buffering and landscaping from adjacent residential uses. Standards should also be directed toward control of light, glare, noise, vibration, water and air pollution; use and storage of toxic, hazardous or explosive materials; and outdoor storage and waste disposal.

**EXISTING AND PROPOSED GREEN SPACE AND/OR PARKS:** Areas that are devoted to green spaces including golf courses, open spaces and park uses, or are proposed for green spaces are shown on the Land Use Map. Green spaces contribute to the health and well-being of the community and should be preserved where feasible. The location shown on the map of future green spaces is just an approximation, and the design of future spaces should be well integrated into the surrounding context, with maximum opportunity for pedestrian and bicycle access.

- Priority for 5.3.1 should be a priority level of 1 or 2.
- Priority for 5.6.2 should not be public information, but should be enforcement.
- Page 58, reference Plantation Country Club and delete acreage.

---

Verification of approval

Date